

Bristol Race Equality Strategic Leaders Group

Report Title :	Bristol's Draft response to the Race Disparity Audit (by Public Sector data)
Date of Meeting :	November 2019
Report Author :	Andrew Mallin
Job Title :	Race Equality Strategic Leaders Group delivery manager
Contact details :	Andrew.Mallin@bristol.gov.uk
Purpose of Report :	<p>During July's meeting of the Bristol Race Equality Strategic Leaders group it was agreed that an initial scoping piece of work would be undertaken by the group to collate the many wider race related data sets that are held by all the group's public sector organisations.</p> <p>The purpose of this piece of work would be to ensure that the group would have an initial reference point of what each organisation holds in terms of data by race to help future decision making by the group when future areas of focus are to be considered. This collation will provide a reference point should the group wish to build on the very detailed public sector employment data product already produced by the group.</p> <p>During September's meeting (2019) each partner agency provided a brief verbal update on what race equality data they held, in relation to wider data sets including service users, students, community members or customers as well as staff (over and above the pay, sickness, grievance and disciplinary H.R. data already captured). Those agencies unable to attend submitted covering e-mails to share their key data headings by race.</p> <p>The group agreed that as this is an initial scoping exercise no actual data is required at this stage, all that was to be collated was high level bullet point lists of all ethnicity data sets held. It was noted by the group that resource will need to be considered where further data deep dives are to be pursued by the group.</p> <p>Alignment with the Government's Race Disparity Audit : -</p> <p>It was proposed at September's meeting that a partnership collated response on behalf of the group could be aligned with the key pillars of the Government's Race Disparity Audit to allow for a framework with which to build on with future pieces of work. The Race Disparity Audit contains 8 key categories which are listed below for ease of reference. Therefore all agency responses are listed under the most relevant heading of the key themes below to help focus and shape the collated group response.</p> <p>The below work also aligns with the data headings held within the Government's ethnicity facts and figures website found here.</p>



Bristol Race Equality Strategic Leaders Group

	<p>Race Disparity Audit - 8 key themes</p> <p>1) Community 2) Education 3) Labour market participation and income 4) Housing 5) Crime and policing 6) Criminal Justice System 7) Health 8) Public Sector Workforce</p>												
Alignment to annual work plan of Strategic Leaders group :	<p>This builds on the key action of producing Bristol’s second Race Equality Data product during the 2019 work plan. The RESLGs group work plan for 2020 will be confirmed in early 2020.</p>												
Opportunities / Benefits :	<p>This scoping work could potentially facilitate the opportunity for Bristol’s Race Equality Strategic Leaders group (and wider partners) to work towards producing a direct city wide response to the Government’s Race Disparity Audit.</p> <p>In compiling this report it is recognised there will be opportunities to collate a wider Bristol response. This can be achieved by building on this initial response by cross referencing other relevant pieces of work underway that are also using data and being progressed by other key strategic groups and bodies across the city.</p> <p>With approval from these wider groups and Bristol’s RESLG future iterations of a city response could include other detailed pieces of relevant work such as the Lammy Review work and the Commission on Race Equality’s work focusing on Education.</p>												
Contributing agencies to date	<p>During the scoping exercise responses have been received from a broad range of public sector agencies working across Bristol namely (including abbreviations used in report) : -</p> <table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Crown Prosecution Service (CSP)</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">North Bristol NHS Trust (NBT)</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">University of the West of England, Bristol (UWE)</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">University of Bristol (UoB)</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Avon and Wiltshire Mental Health Partnership NHS Trust (AWP)</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Bristol City Council (BCC)</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">Probation Service Bristol and South Gloucestershire Local Delivery Unit (Probation)</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Avon and Somerset Constabulary (Police)</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">University Hospitals Bristol NHS Foundation Trust (UHB)</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">HMP Bristol</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 5px;">NHS Bristol, North Somerset & South Gloucestershire CCG</td> <td style="padding: 5px;">Avon Fire & Rescue Service (AFRS)</td> </tr> </table>	Crown Prosecution Service (CSP)	North Bristol NHS Trust (NBT)	University of the West of England, Bristol (UWE)	University of Bristol (UoB)	Avon and Wiltshire Mental Health Partnership NHS Trust (AWP)	Bristol City Council (BCC)	Probation Service Bristol and South Gloucestershire Local Delivery Unit (Probation)	Avon and Somerset Constabulary (Police)	University Hospitals Bristol NHS Foundation Trust (UHB)	HMP Bristol	NHS Bristol, North Somerset & South Gloucestershire CCG	Avon Fire & Rescue Service (AFRS)
Crown Prosecution Service (CSP)	North Bristol NHS Trust (NBT)												
University of the West of England, Bristol (UWE)	University of Bristol (UoB)												
Avon and Wiltshire Mental Health Partnership NHS Trust (AWP)	Bristol City Council (BCC)												
Probation Service Bristol and South Gloucestershire Local Delivery Unit (Probation)	Avon and Somerset Constabulary (Police)												
University Hospitals Bristol NHS Foundation Trust (UHB)	HMP Bristol												
NHS Bristol, North Somerset & South Gloucestershire CCG	Avon Fire & Rescue Service (AFRS)												



Bristol Race Equality Strategic Leaders Group

Bristol's Data alignment to the Race Disparity Audit	<p>All responses received have been aligned to the most appropriate theme of the Government's Race Disparity Audit as listed below : -</p> <p>Race Disparity Audit - 8 key themes</p> <p>1) Community 2) Education 3) Labour market participation and income 4) Housing 5) Crime and policing 6) Criminal Justice System 7) Health 8) Public Sector Workforce</p>																													
	1)	<p style="text-align: center;">Community</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><i>see health and other key themes for relevant information.</i></p>																												
	2)	<p style="text-align: center;">Education</p>																												
		<table border="1" style="width: 100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr style="background-color: #d9e1f2;"> <th style="text-align: center;">Race related data sets held</th> <th style="text-align: center;">Agency</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">A range of key pieces of work in relation to the Education theme are being led in Bristol by the Commission on Race Equality (CORE). These key initiatives can be referenced and included for future iterations of this document with specific data sets being focused on.</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 2px;">CORE</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">Success at graduation and careers after graduation. Education outcomes covering schools, colleges and universities and there will be consistency by educational level in data recording.</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 2px;">UWE, Bristol</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">UWE could also break the data down to look at the pathways into healthcare or education professions.</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 2px;">UWE, Bristol</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">Application data (Home Undergraduate UCAS applications BAME/White breakdown) – External Relations.</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 2px;">UoB</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">Admissions data (Home UG registrations BAME/White breakdown as well as by HESA ethnicity codes) – External Relations</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 2px;">UoB</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">Retention data (Home UG BAME/White breakdown as well as by HESA ethnicity codes) – Student Inclusion</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 2px;">UoB</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">Awards data (Home UG BAME/White breakdown as well as by HESA ethnicity codes) – Student Inclusion</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 2px;">UoB</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">Data on progression to careers/PG study (Home UG BAME/White breakdown as well as by HESA ethnicity codes)</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 2px;">UoB</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">Ethnicity data on all Children in Care -</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 2px;">BCC</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">Ethnicity by school attendance and attainment.</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 2px;">BCC</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">Attainment for Phonics, EY, KS1, KS2 and KS4 for both Attainment 8 & Progress 8</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 2px;">BCC</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">Exclusions</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 2px;">BCC</td> </tr> <tr> <td style="padding: 2px;">SEN(D) - Attainment EY, Ks1, KS2 and KS4 A8 and P8-only SEN</td> <td style="text-align: center; padding: 2px;">BCC</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Race related data sets held	Agency	A range of key pieces of work in relation to the Education theme are being led in Bristol by the Commission on Race Equality (CORE). These key initiatives can be referenced and included for future iterations of this document with specific data sets being focused on.	CORE	Success at graduation and careers after graduation. Education outcomes covering schools, colleges and universities and there will be consistency by educational level in data recording.	UWE, Bristol	UWE could also break the data down to look at the pathways into healthcare or education professions.	UWE, Bristol	Application data (Home Undergraduate UCAS applications BAME/White breakdown) – External Relations.	UoB	Admissions data (Home UG registrations BAME/White breakdown as well as by HESA ethnicity codes) – External Relations	UoB	Retention data (Home UG BAME/White breakdown as well as by HESA ethnicity codes) – Student Inclusion	UoB	Awards data (Home UG BAME/White breakdown as well as by HESA ethnicity codes) – Student Inclusion	UoB	Data on progression to careers/PG study (Home UG BAME/White breakdown as well as by HESA ethnicity codes)	UoB	Ethnicity data on all Children in Care -	BCC	Ethnicity by school attendance and attainment.	BCC	Attainment for Phonics, EY, KS1, KS2 and KS4 for both Attainment 8 & Progress 8	BCC	Exclusions	BCC	SEN(D) - Attainment EY, Ks1, KS2 and KS4 A8 and P8-only SEN	BCC
Race related data sets held	Agency																													
A range of key pieces of work in relation to the Education theme are being led in Bristol by the Commission on Race Equality (CORE). These key initiatives can be referenced and included for future iterations of this document with specific data sets being focused on.	CORE																													
Success at graduation and careers after graduation. Education outcomes covering schools, colleges and universities and there will be consistency by educational level in data recording.	UWE, Bristol																													
UWE could also break the data down to look at the pathways into healthcare or education professions.	UWE, Bristol																													
Application data (Home Undergraduate UCAS applications BAME/White breakdown) – External Relations.	UoB																													
Admissions data (Home UG registrations BAME/White breakdown as well as by HESA ethnicity codes) – External Relations	UoB																													
Retention data (Home UG BAME/White breakdown as well as by HESA ethnicity codes) – Student Inclusion	UoB																													
Awards data (Home UG BAME/White breakdown as well as by HESA ethnicity codes) – Student Inclusion	UoB																													
Data on progression to careers/PG study (Home UG BAME/White breakdown as well as by HESA ethnicity codes)	UoB																													
Ethnicity data on all Children in Care -	BCC																													
Ethnicity by school attendance and attainment.	BCC																													
Attainment for Phonics, EY, KS1, KS2 and KS4 for both Attainment 8 & Progress 8	BCC																													
Exclusions	BCC																													
SEN(D) - Attainment EY, Ks1, KS2 and KS4 A8 and P8-only SEN	BCC																													



Bristol Race Equality Strategic Leaders Group

Autistic Spectrum Conditions	BCC
Hearing Impairment	BCC
Moderate Learning Difficulty	BCC
Multi-Sensory Impairment	BCC
Other Difficulty/Disability	BCC
Physical Disability	BCC
Profound & Multiple Learning Difficulty	BCC
SEN support but no specialist assessment of type of need	BCC
Severe Learning Difficulty	BCC
Social, Emotional and Mental Health	BCC
Specific Learning Difficulty	BCC
Speech, Language and Communication Needs	BCC
Visual Impairment	BCC
Ethnicity data also held on Educational attainment : - <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Early Years GLD ▪ Key Stage Reading, Writing & Maths combined (RWM) ▪ Key Stage Reading, Writing & Maths combined (RWM) ▪ Key Stage 4 GCSE attainment 	BCC

3)	Labour market participation and income <i>n/a at time of report</i>
-----------	---

4)	Housing	
	Race related data sets held	Agency
	Housing and Landlord Services has approximately 33,000 tenants living in 27,000 homes. By ethnicity : 70% White British, 19% BME, 6% not known and 4% White Other.	Bristol City Council
	Ethnicity information for all housing applicants on the housing register (housing waiting list) - approximately 12,800 households.	Bristol City Council
	Ethnicity information for residents who receive housing service provision.	Bristol City Council
	Ethnicity data in relation to households requesting homeless prevention advice or services.	Bristol City Council



Bristol Race Equality Strategic Leaders Group

5)	Crime and Policing <i>(To be cross referenced with Criminal Justice Sector headings listed below)</i>
-----------	---

In addition to the data sets listed below, this section of the response can be expanded further by cross referencing additional criminal justice sector data sets being utilised under the work of the Lammy Review group active within the region. Some of these data sets are listed below and additional sets specific to the group can be included for future iterations of this report.

Race related data sets held	Agency
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Anti-Social Behaviour cases - Restorative Justice - Hate Crime Services - Chanel / Prevent 	Bristol City Council – Community Safety
Disproportionality Profile 2018 -The number of BAME young people in Bristol who enter the youth justice system in line with the BAME population in the 10-17 age group. -BAME young people in the Pre-Court Outcomes -BAME Young people in Community Outcomes -BAME Young people in Custodial Outcomes -Ethnicity of young people that Bristol YOT work with	Bristol City Council – Youth Offending Team
Scrutiny of police powers panel	PCC
Quarterly Stop and Search Report for Scrutiny Panel	PCC
Police Use of Powers report by ethnicity	Avon & Somerset Police

6)	Criminal Justice System <i>(To be cross referenced with Crime and Policing headings listed above)</i>
-----------	---

In addition to the data sets listed below, this section of the response can be expanded further by cross referencing additional criminal justice sector data sets being utilised under the work of the Lammy Review group active within the region. Some of these data sets are listed below and additional sets specific to the group can be included for future iterations of this report.

Race related data sets held	Agency
Ethnic background of defendants to understand any disproportionality in CPS decision making across defendants.	CPS
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -No of prisoners with ACCT open (per month) -No of prisoners committed violent act (per month) -No of prisoners victim of violence (per month) -No of prisoners where staff used UoF (per month) 	HM Prison Bristol



Bristol Race Equality Strategic Leaders Group

-No of prisoners segregated (per month) -No of prisoners on ROTL / ROR / RDR -No of prisoners refused HDC if applicable (per month) -No of prisoners enrolled in Weston College (Education) -No of prisoners attended gym (per month) -Orderlies/Red bands (snapshot) -No of Server Workers if applicable (snapshot) -No of Kitchen Workers (snapshot) -Prisoners on closed visits (per month) -Intel led searching (tasked by security) (per month)	
Ongoing work being led by Lammy Review group in relation to recording practices around ethnicity characteristics across all Criminal Justice Sector agencies.	Lammy Review Group, PCC and all Criminal Justice Sector Partners
Ensure CRC complies with Lammy Review Recommendation 32. Collecting data to cover all protected characteristics	Probation
Complaints made by service users by ethnicity to ensure no groups receive disproportionately lower outcomes/service	Probation
Percentage of total caseload by ethnicity	Probation
Accredited programme completions by ethnicity	Probation
Breaches by ethnicity	Probation

7)	Health	
	Race related data sets held	Agency
	Equality Delivery System grading exercise (min. every 4 years) designed to help local NHS organisations, with local stakeholders, to review and improve their performance for patients, communities and staff in respect to all nine characteristics protected by the Equality Act-we collect demographic data of those consulted with.	NHS Organisations
	Inpatient & Outpatient admissions / attendances	UHB
	Inpatient Survey results	UHB
	Patient complaints	UHB
	JSNA community data-various cuts of data that explore health/social inequalities by race	NBT
	Inpatient & Outpatient admissions / attendances	NBT
	BAME Service Users of Community Services by Service (e.g Dementia Services; Assessment & Recovery; Early Intervention)	AWP
	BAME Service Users using In-patient services	AWP
	BAME Service Users in Secure Services	AWP
	BAME Service Users in our Specialised Services	AWP
	BAME Service Users in our CAMHS services	AWP



Bristol Race Equality Strategic Leaders Group

BAME Service Users in our Specialised Services (e.g. Specialist Deaf Mental Health Services; Forensic Learning Disability Team etc.)	AWP
BAME Complaints, Comments and Compliments	AWP
BAME Friends and Family Test	AWP
BAME Community Services FFT survey	AWP
BAME Service Users with Care Programme Approach (CPA) in place	AWP
BAME Service Users with Care Programme Approach (CPA) reviews	AWP
BAME Serious Untoward Incidents (SUI)	AWP
Public Health Commissioned Services ethnicity data on – - Sexual Health Services - Drug and Alcohol Treatment Services - Integrated Child Health Services - Stop Smoking Services - Mid Life Health Checks	Bristol City Council
Outcomes of individuals who are receiving treatment for drug and alcohol interventions.	Bristol City Council
** The Equality Delivery System is the NHS improvement tool for Hospital Trusts	

8)	Public Sector Workforce <i>(Data already contained in Bristol's Race Equality H.R. Data product not listed)</i>
-----------	---

*Please note that data headings listed below are only those categories not already included in version 1 (2017) and version 2 (2019) of Bristol's Race Equality H.R. Data product. Within these published reports all agencies included in this response already submit the following data to inform Bristol's collective Race Equality picture on a bi-annual basis :-

- **Ethnicity of all employees**
- **Ethnicity by pay band**
- **Ethnicity by disciplinary, long term/persistent sickness, grievance**
- **Comparison of collective performance against ethnicity groups of Bristol's population**

Race related data sets held	Agency
Recruitment to university	UWE
Retention in university	UWE
Staff in post / starters / leavers	UHB
Recruitment – applicants / shortlisted / appointed	UHB
Data reported for the Workforce Race Equality Standard:	NHS Organisations
Percentage of staff in each of the Agenda for Change Bands 1-9 or Medical and Dental subgroups and Very Senior Managers (including	NHS Organisations



Bristol Race Equality Strategic Leaders Group

executive Board members) compared with % of staff in all workforce.	
Relative likelihood of BME staff being appointed from shortlisting compared with white staff across all posts	NHS Organisations
Relative likelihood of BME staff accessing non-mandatory training & CPD compared with white staff	NHS Organisations
National NHS Staff Survey indicators (comparing the responses for white and BME staff)	NHS Organisations
% of staff experiencing harassment, bullying or abuse from patients, relatives or public in last 12 months	NHS Organisations
% believing that the organisation provides equal opportunities for career progression or promotion	NHS Organisations
In the last 12 months have staff personally experienced discrimination at work from any of the following? Manager/team leader or other colleagues	NHS Organisations
Percentage difference between the organisations' Board membership and its overall workforce disaggregated: • By voting membership of the Board • By executive membership of the Board (comparing the difference for white and BME staff)	NHS Organisations
Examine workforce representation against local populations & BAME progression and representation through the CPS grading system.	CPS
Examines engagement levels to assess cultural or operational issues that could adversely affect engagement / motivation / productivity.	CPS
Examines the work/life balance of employees via take-up of various schemes / application of policies, adherence to relevant legislation.	CPS
Examines data to ensure that reasons for leaving are personal rather than as a result of cultural reasons or operational process.	CPS
Staff in post / starters / leavers/moves/sickness/appraisal rates	NBT
Recruitment – applicants / shortlisted / appointed	NBT
Bullying & harassment / performance management	NBT
Data reported for the Workforce Race Equality Standard-The same for all NHS organisations, this is part of our Contracted requirements	All NHS Trusts
BAME Starters and Leavers	AWP
BAME Access to Non-Statutory / Mandatory Training	AWP
Job applications received and shortlisted by ethnicity	BCC
Job offers by ethnicity	BCC
Training by ethnicity	BCC
Leavers by ethnicity	BCC
Leaving reason by ethnicity	BCC
Application, Shortlisting, Interview Outcome by ethnicity	UoB
All staff by grade/job/dept by ethnicity	UoB
All staff by ethnicity – intersecting with other protected	UoB



Bristol Race Equality Strategic Leaders Group

	characteristics e.g. gender	
	Promotion/progression	UoB
	Work underway to report on our Ethnicity Pay Gap	UoB
	Analyse and monitor Equality statistics on all new appointments	Probation
Recommendations / proposals :	<p>To take a steer from Bristol's Race Equality Strategic Leaders group at November's meeting on the following matters : -</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Partner agencies review this document and advise of any additional ethnicity data categories they may hold (taking in to account that all those submitted to date have been included). 2) Does the group wish to explore further alignment to cross reference with (in particular) the following work streams that are also utilising ethnicity data for inclusion in the development of this city wide report : - <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Work of Lammy Review Group ➤ Education work being led by CORE ➤ BSWN and UWE work ➤ BeOnBoard and NHS work on Board representation 3) Does this group wish for this report to be shared with the Government's Race Disparity Unit for them to be aware of the draft response to the Race Disparity Audit compiled in Bristol. This could enable future opportunities and collaboration ? 4) Are there any other networks or forums the group wish to share this draft with ? 5) Group members note that (as per previous steer) this draft only references public sector data held. 	
Appendices :	<p>The Government's Race Disparity Audit : - https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/686071/Revised_RDA_report_March_2018.pdf</p>	

